



Planning and Zoning Commission Special Meeting - MINUTES

**Monday, February 24, 2020
Ketchum City Hall
480 East Avenue North, Ketchum, ID 83340**

4:45 PM - CALL TO ORDER AT SITE

The Meeting was called to order at the site at 4:45 PM by Chairman Neil Morrow.

1. Agenda Posting Report

The agenda was accepted as written.

2. SITE VISIT - Ketchum Boutique Hotel Design Review: 260 E River Street (Lots 1, 2, 3, and Fr 21 and 22, Block 82, Ketchum)

RECONVENE AT CITY HALL

The meeting was reconvened at City Hall at 5:30 PM by Chairman Neil Morrow.

COMMISSION REPORTS AND DISCUSSION

Commissioner Eggers reported a conversation with Jason Shearer regarding parking at the Y. Commissioner Carter reported a conversation with a neighbor of the fire station regarding setbacks.

PUBLIC COMMENT - Communications from the public for items not on the agenda.

Chairman Neil Morrow opened the floor for public comment. There were no comments and comments were closed.

PUBLIC HEARINGS AND COMMUNICATIONS FROM STAFF – ACTION ITEMS

- 2. ACTION - Ketchum Fire Station Design Review (107 Saddle Road)** The Commission will consider and take action on a design review application submitted by Cole Architects on behalf of the City of Ketchum for the new fire station and associated site improvements located within the Tourist (T) Zoning District. The proposed 16,419 sq ft, two-story facility will accommodate four bays for fire apparatus, a turnout locker-room, rescue and technical gear storage, offices for Fire Department staff, a public meeting room, and firefighter living quarters. *(Continued from February 10, 2020)*

Associate Planner Abby Rivin recapped the prior meeting and Commission's request for information on the parking and traffic study and the landscape plan.

Matt Huffield, Cole Architects, presented the updated renderings of the project and landscape plan. Changes in windows were discussed.

Bill McLaughlin, Fire Chief, spoke to the turning radius at the new facility, comparing it with the old fire station and similar stations in Boise, located near a school and a church. The Boise sites had more traffic than Warm Springs Rd, experiencing 20,000+ vehicles per day while Highway 75 has 4,600 and Warm Springs 850 vehicles per day. Federal Traffic Control standards recommend control devices at 900 vehicles per hour. Trees were not included in the Landscape plan as to not impede visibility. Truck 1 is a 107-foot ladder truck which will serve buildings up to 6 or 7 stories. The current station design will accommodate the turning radius for this truck. All other trucks have a smaller turning radius.

Chairman Morrow opened the floor for Public Comment.

Doug Ellsley, 331 Lewis St, asked Staff about the waiver of setbacks for the Y, Northwood Place, and the Fire Station. He expressed concern over the impact to his property of a zero setback.

Gary Hoffman, 25-year resident, expressed his displeasure with the past and present members of the Planning and Zoning Commission. He worked on the passing of the Fire Bond. The current station is housed in an inadequate building in a congested location. He criticized the Commission for addressing parking, safety and landscaping when those issues were never recognized at the current location. He questioned why the Commission is concerned with parking when the Y and City have an agreement in place. He was concerned about delaying the project unnecessarily.

Chair Morrow responded that Public Safety details are being addressed without delaying the project. The Commission has reviewed the projects being built around town and the projects are better for that review.

Dick Fosbury, Y Board member, asked about the parking plan for the Y. He pointed out the flaws in the published plan. He wanted to protect the parking for the Y after the station is built. He thought it should be reviewed by the engineer, fire, and appropriate departments. He thought there was a newer design than the one in the packet.

Chair Morrow asked Staff to research and replace the drawing, if necessary.

Suzanne Frick, City Administrator, stated this was an indicative drawing showing a possible layout with more detail to come.

Commissioner Eggers asked how many parking spaces were shown in this drawing.

Frick responded this drawing included 175 spaces, 110 in the North and 65 in the South sections.

Jason Shearer, CEO of YMCA, supported the fire bond and the location of the station. Parking totals were agreed upon between the Y and the City and wants to see a final plan for parking spaces. He expressed concern that the City will not be able to provide total agreed upon spaces and wants to rely on the Commission to approve a plan for the agreed spaces with adequate safety measures.

David Hurd, Warm Springs resident, expressed the fire station has been pushed through by the City Council and appreciates the time the Commission is taking to review. He thought the vote in December was inappropriately timed. He objected to choosing the site prior to traffic studies for the optional sites.

There were no further comments and Public Comment was closed.

Commissioner Cosgrove complemented the Commission on the work they do. She took issue with the traffic study not including pedestrian traffic.

Commissioner Carter was supportive of seeing more information on traffic, parking, and safety before moving forward.

Vice-Chair Mead wanted assurance the parking commitment can be met, and the City and Y can come to an agreement. He felt although the location may not be ideal, the new station is important for the community and safety issues will be addressed.

Commissioner Eggers asked Staff for clarification on the setbacks. Planner Rivin detailed the history of the use of the property as to further development including the YMCA, Northwood Place and the Northwood carport.

Director Gaeddert confirmed the plan for the property included the proposed buildings with zero-setbacks at the rear property line. The existing carport was not designed to support an additional structure. The parking spaces for the Station includes the spaces within the building and the turning radius. He encouraged collaboration on the parking plan. He recommended warning lights adjacent to the building, but the traffic counts do not support additional traffic lights at intersections.

Commissioner Eggers asked for clarification of the number of parking spaces.

Frick gave the breakdown of spaces; 80 spaces in the north lot area, 50 spaces in the south lot prior to expansion. If the Y expands, 170 spaces will be available on site. Further plans would be made when the Y knows the extent of expansion plans.

Commissioner Eggers asked about a possible ice rink to the north.

Jason Shearer related one of the options is a rink, but the Y was not tied down to that option. The parking agreement states 150 spaces after the construction of the fire station, with 200 available spaces in the area when the building permit is issued. He asked for an addendum showing all parking spaces.

Commissioner Eggers had experienced few pedestrians using the sidewalk across the front of the station as opposed to the amount of traffic on the bike path across the street and noted the south parking lot is virtually unused. He was dismayed to hear the expanded parking area would remove art and landscaping. He also expressed a desire to see additional trees in the Northeast and in the artificial turf area. He questioned the removal of trees outside the boundaries of the project.

Commissioner Carter asked about possible conditions to be added to the approval. Planner Rivin indicated Condition 11 would be Commission recommendations. This would be reviewed by City Council.

Chair Morrow wanted to ensure the spaces are available for the Y. He recommended a total signage plan for the Warm Springs area intersections.

Planner Rivin added that the condition of approval includes the parking agreement. Director Gaeddert noted the AECOM traffic report can be adopted as written or can be modified. Chair Morrow wanted to give recommendations to the Council for traffic control measures.

Commissioner Carter asked about the future possibility of adding another floor on to the building.

Matt Huffield added that the structure is not designed to be any higher than the current proposed design.

Bill Gigray, City Attorney, and the Commission discussed possible conditions to the approval. He noted all street designs must be approved by the city engineer and the Street Department prior to final approval.

Frick noted that the traffic study and the traffic engineer will make the safety recommendations and design. The Council does not have the discretion to change the safety recommendations of the traffic engineer due to the liability to the City.

Rivin summarized the recommendations to City Council to include 1) an updated drawing of the parking plan, 2) Update Landscape Plan to include two (2) additional trees, and 3) final traffic study to be reviewed by Ketchum City Council to include any recommended systems and a wholistic signage plan for the surrounding area.

Motion to approve the Ketchum Fire Station Design Review Application with the Conditions 1-10 as noted with the addition of Conditions 11-12 and authorize the Chair to sign the Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law.

Motion made by Commissioner Eggers, Seconded by Commissioner Carter.

Voting Yea: Chairman Morrow, Vice-Chair Mead, Commissioner Carter, Commissioner Cosgrove, Commissioner Eggers

4. **ACTION - Ketchum Boutique Hotel Design Review: 260 E. River Street (Lots 1, 2, 3, FR 21 and 22, Block 82)** The Commission will consider and take action on a design review application submitted by PEG Ketchum Hotel LLC (of 180 N. University Ave, Suite 200, Provo, UT 84601), represented by Nick Blayden, for a proposed new hotel located on three parcels. The subject development site is approximately 47,249 square feet and is zoned Tourist (T). The proposed hotel consists of approximately 92 hotel rooms, on-site employee housing for 23 employees, a ground-floor restaurant, conference and meeting space, parking garage, roof top bar, and outdoor public plaza, among other features. The hotel is proposed at an overall project size of approximately 128,436 square feet with a maximum height of 72 feet. Waivers to the city's minimum lot size, floor area ratio, height, and side setbacks requirements are proposed.

Commissioner Eggers recused himself from this agenda item.

Planning Director John Gaeddert gave a summary of the prior hearings and areas considered by the Commission and the City Council. Five applications were considered, including a Pre-Design Review. Areas of discussion had covered architectural elements, circulation of traffic, and setbacks to the west. Recommendations from the Planning and Zoning Commission had been considered by the City Council. The Council is waiting for the Planning and Zoning Commission recommendations on the full Design Review package which will become part of the Development Agreement. Gaeddert informed the Commission that the Council had received a Letter of Reconsideration on behalf of a neighbor.

Nick Blayden, PEG Development, complimented the design team.

Ryan McMullan, AJC Architects, presented the Design Review. The team was working on Dark Skies requirements and Sustainability. He presented an overview of the site plan, traffic merges,

mass, employee housing, and floor plans. The Main Street corner is to have the feeling of the start to the Downtown district. A corner restaurant includes a public gathering area and a fire pit.

Nicole Cary, Kurt Eggers Associates Landscape Architects, noted landscaping is to include native plants. The proposed landscaping along the highway promotes a forested atmosphere to include pine, fir, and Aspen trees with shrubs and natural grasses. The west side to include a buffer of trees and shrubs. The riparian zone to remain natural with possible public access. Some green roofs and terraces with planters.

McMullan noted Trail Creek will have little clean-up and possible public access. Planner Skelton noted this can be approved administratively. At the lower level, employee housing to be contained within the hotel with connection to the outdoors. The next level is office space and guest rooms. The River Street floor to include a restaurant, lounge, and lobby. The 2nd floor is hotel rooms and conference rooms with outdoor patios. Third Floor has the rooftop bar and hotel rooms. Top floor is hotel rooms. The exterior materials include stone, shou-sugi wood, clear cedar trimmed with black steel. The rooftop bar to include chairlift swings and a drink rail.

Chair Morrow opened the floor to public comment:

Garry Slette, attorney for Dick Clotfelter and Big Burn, LLC. (owners of Limelight Condo units) and five (5) owners of Trail Creek Crossings Condos. A Reconsideration Request was submitted to the City Council. His clients support the concept but not this the proposal. The Design Review ordinance requires the project meet the design standards. He objected to the number of floors, the waivers for the minimum lot size. He requested the Commission follow the requirements of the zoning ordinance.

Ben Worst, attorney for owner of neighboring property at 220 E River Street, stated his client approves of the current design including the sixteen (16) foot setback but wants more information on the retaining wall, utilities, and the garage and laundry venting.

Joanie Cashman, neighbor to the south, expressed concern with light pollution, traffic, possible noise from the outdoor bar, and ice on the sidewalk into town.

McMullen responded that the electrical location was mandated by Idaho Power. The Public Utility Easement determined the location. The venting is a passive system, not forced air. The laundry has commercial gas dryers venting to that side. No lint is emitted from the dryers. The walkways on the Hotel property would be heated. The sidewalk is outside the Hotel property. As to the noise, the rooms facing south are guest rooms, elimination of noise is a priority and lighting will conform to Dark Skies standards.

Cashman asked about the location of the cranes for the story poles. She asked about the amount of noise from the bar.

Blayden responded that the bar is not a party place, but a low-key, after-ski gathering spot.

There were no additional comments and Public Comment was closed.

Vice-Chair Mead asked about sustainability features.

McMullen showed the Dark Skies lighting and energy efficient materials. The goal is for a high-performance building. Locally sourced materials are preferred. Low VOC materials are used in all areas.

Vice-Chair Mead asked about the height and irrigation of the shrubbery on the highway side.

Cary replied the shrubs would be six (6) feet. Mead asked about the winter effect. Cary replied it is mostly evergreen so it will be effective screening all year long.

Mead appreciated the efforts in breaking up the mass of the building in various ways but was still concerned with the mass of the project. McMullan added the retaining wall may be used as a space for art.

Commissioner Cosgrove appreciated the changes the developer had made to the plans in response to Community comments. She liked the materials and the open corners and would like to see public art at the 12-foot wall.

Commissioner Carter thought the trees were a major factor in the presence of the building and wanted assurance trees would be viable and well maintained. He thought the riparian zone should be left as is without a public access point.

Blayden expressed a desire to just clean up the site of dead materials.

Commissioner Cosgrove preferred intentional access to informal access. Morrow agreed. Carter liked the materials and colors. He wanted to see timeless design features. Cosgrove also liked the materials. Carter asked about the firepit. Blayden responded they are anticipating using wood.

Bill Gigray, City Attorney, spoke to the Findings for the PUD/CUP, regarding the minimum lot size. In response to Gary Slette's argument, the City Council review determined that the PUD Ordinance Section A, subsection Four (4) was applicable to a hotel. The question of the 4-floor limitation in the Tourist Zone is not in the PUD Ordinance so a waiver is not required for a PUD Application. A Request for Reconsideration had been received and will be taken up by the City Council.

Vice-Chair Mead liked the building but thought the riparian zone would need some rehabilitation after the construction. He expressed concern for the landscaping on Highway 75 as it is a vital part of the design and wanted to be sure the landscaping would survive.

Blayden expressed the importance of the beauty of the landscaping all year round as part of the guest experience as well.

Chair Morrow expressed how much the project has improved with each presentation. He appreciated how the developer has incorporated the suggestions from the Commission and thinks it will be a good addition to the Community.

Director Gaeddert stated there are 15 Conditions in the Staff Report and asked if the Commission wanted to see additional details on the laundry and generator.

Commissioners Cosgrove and Mead wanted to see more detail on the landscaping.

Motion to direct Staff to prepare the final Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law, and Order of Decision in accordance with the Staff Report of February 24, 2020 subject to additional Findings and Orders of Decision based on the continuance of this hearing and the additional renderings brought forth to be included in those Findings with final action on March 9, 2020 and continue this hearing to March 9, 2020.

Motion made by Vice-Chair Mead, Seconded by Commissioner Cosgrove.

Voting Yea: Chairman Morrow, Vice-Chair Mead, Commissioner Carter, Commissioner Cosgrove,

Abstain: Commissioner Eggers

STAFF REPORTS AND CITY COUNCIL UPDATES

Senior Planner Brittany Skelton related the City Council Meeting on March 2nd to include a continuation of a plat amendment for the West Ketchum Townhouses and the PEG Hotel Reconsideration request.

On March 9th PZ meeting there will be the W Ketchum Residences Preliminary Plat, Pre-Design Review for the 4th and Walnut Mixed-Use Building, PEG Hotel Design Review, and Ketch II amendment, possibly the Mountainland Design Showroom Pre-Design Review.

Director Gaeddert informed the Commissioner there currently is not a need for additional PZ meetings. In a couple of months, we may have an amendment to the Warm Springs Ranch Development Agreement.

ADJOURNMENT

Motion to adjourn.

Motion made by Chairman Morrow, Seconded by Commissioner Carter.

Voting Yea: Chairman Morrow, Vice-Chair Mead, Commissioner Carter, Commissioner Cosgrove, Commissioner Eggers



Neil Morrow - Chairman